The Present and Future State of Blended Learning in Workplace Learning Settings in the United States
Curtis J. Bonk, Indiana University, cjbok@iu.edu
Kyong-Hee "KJ" Kim, Portland State University
Eun Jung Oh, Univ. of Georgia
Ya-Ting Teng, University of Illinois
Su Jin Son, University of Illinois
AHRD Conference, Indianapolis, 2007

"E-learning proponents promised just-in-time, just-for-me, anytime, anywhere, 24x7, interactive, streaming, real-time, asynchronous, pervasive, motivational, emotional, collaborative, multimedia, blended, adaptive, personalized, intuitive, rich, engaging, strategic, empowering, scalable, consistent, efficient, and cost-effective learning."

Blended learning Study: Introduction
- The growing importance of blended learning in workplace learning internationally (Bonk & Graham, 2006; Rossett & Frazee, 2006)
- Confusions about blended learning exists (eLearning Guild, 2003)
  □What does blended learning really mean?
  □What are optimal blends?
  □How blended learning should be evaluated?

AMA Special Report, Blended Learning Opportunities; Alison Rossett (2006)
1. Anchor Blend: Start FTF, then online
2. Bookend Blend: Three part: e.g., online preassessments, then FTF, and then online post assessments
3. Field Blend: Assets, resources, and choices including perhaps FTF

The IBM Four Tier Learning Model (2006)
Blending Learning for Business Impact — IBM’s case for learning success, 2006 Handbook of Blended Learning, Nancy Lewis, VP, & Peter Orton, IBM

Fully Online and Blended Learning Advantages
1. Increased Learning (better papers, higher scores)
2. More effective pedagogy and interaction
3. Course access at one’s convenience and flexible completion
4. Personalized access to a range of materials
5. Accommodate more learning styles
6. Connect different nationalities and cultures
7. Reduction in physical class or space needs, commuting, parking
8. Increased opportunities for human interaction, communication, & contact among students
9. Introverts participate more
10. Cost effective, time, satisfaction
Precursors to this Study

- "Online Training in the Online World" (2001-2002)
- "Surveying the future of workplace e-learning: The rise of blending, interactivity, and authentic learning" (2003-2004)

Purpose of the Study

- To explore the current and future trends of blended learning in U.S. corporations.

Definition of Blended learning: Combination of face-to-face training and online learning.

Research Questions

- How is blended learning being perceived and practiced in workplace learning settings today?
- How is blended learning expected to be perceived and practiced in the next few years?
- Are there cross-cultural differences in the current status and future trends of blended learning? If so, what are the differences?

Tool Used was SurveyShare

SurveyShare.com

Created Unique Surveys in Four Languages

Take Survey

SurveyShare.com
Methods: Survey Respondents

- Target: Training/HRD (human resource development) professionals who belonged to professional organizations, discussion forums, or listservs on HRD, e-learning, or blended learning.

Methods: Survey Respondents

- Respondents: (N = 118)
  - Employed in various types of organization (e.g., government, business, not-for-profit)
  - 41% female, 59 male
  - Other four countries...
    - South Korea = 136
    - Taiwan = 312
    - United Kingdom = 202
    - China = 105

Size of Respondent Organizations

4. How many employees are in your organization?

Primary Role of Respondents

5. What is your primary job role or title?

Findings I: Current State of Blended Learning

37% in China (26% just started and 11% for more than 2 years) and 45% in Taiwan using BL is far lower than US (75%), UK (73%), and Korea (63%) (Yoon, Kim, Zehr, Son, Teng, & Oh, 2006)

7. Is your organization using blended learning as part of its employee training?
Respondents' Views of Blended Learning

8. Do you see blended learning as (pick the one that you feel best reflects your views):

- Simply one of many methods for delivering training
- Essential for delivering training in your organization
- Not fully proven but well worth trying
- The current buzzword and nothing more
- Just another way to cover up inadequacies of e-learning

How do They Blend?

- Individualized learning
- Online self-paced materials
- Custom e-learning content
- Workshops and other peer-to-peer activities
- asynchronous conferences
- online learning
- synchronous conferencing, what does this mean?
- self-paced software
- asynchronous conferences
- Classmaterial.com
- Customer learning and virtual tutoring
- Hardware/video equipment
- Online coaching and mentoring
- Online simulations and games
- Class and course requirements
- Other

Why Skills are Taught in Blended Courses?

10. Which one of the following skill areas are taught in blended courses?

- Computer Applications/Software Skills
- Inter/Global Skills
- Management/Leadership Skills
- Communication Skills/Teamwork
- Professional and Business Practices
- Analytical and Critical Thinking
- Customer Service Skills
- Personal Development Skills
- General Business Skills
- Executive Education/Development
- Diversity/Cultural Awareness
- E-collaboration
- Information Technology Skills
- Product Specific Information
- Computer Systems/Programming Skills
- Basic Skills
- Other

3-4 Skills Most Taught Through Blended

- US: Computer Applications, Job, New Hire Orientation, Leadership
- UK: Computer Applications, Job, Communication/Teamwork, Personal Development
- Korea: Job Related, Leadership, New Hire Orientation, Basic Skills
- Taiwan: Job Related, New Hire Orientation, Communication/Teamwork Skills
- China: Communication/Teamwork, Basic Skills, Customer Service, Sales/Marketing

3-4 Skills Least Taught Through Blended

- US: Basic Skills, Sales/Marketing, Programming, Product Specific, Professional
- UK: Ethics, New Hire Orientation, Basic Skills, Executive
- Korea: Product Specific, Diversity, Customer Product Training, Compliance
- Taiwan: Diversity, Executive Education, Programming, Leadership, Product Specific, Business Practices
- China: Computer Systems/Programming, New Hire Orientation, Leadership, Product Specific

Greatest Benefit: Why do Blended?

11. What is the greatest benefit of blended learning?

- Learning Appropriateness
- Higher Instructional Content
- Cost Effectiveness
- Acceptability
- Throughput
- Familiarity
- Reusability
- Speed of Distribution

0.00 5.00 10.00 15.00 20.00 25.00 30.00
**Key Drivers for Blended Learning?**

1. What are the key drivers of blended learning in your organization? (check all that apply)

- Improving the quality of the learning experience
- Improving availability and accessibility of learning
- Cost reductions
- New strategies directions or vision within the organization
- External pressures including engaging up with the competition
- Share willingness to change or more key individuals within the organization
- Other

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>%</th>
<th>5%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improving quality of learning experience</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving availability and accessibility of learning</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost reductions</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New strategies directions or vision within the organization</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External pressures including engaging up with the competition</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share willingness to change or more key individuals within the organization</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Greatest Obstacles to Blended Learning?**

12. What is the greatest obstacle or problem you face in utilizing blended learning?

- Time to develop blended learning resources
- Lack of understanding of the potential of blended learning
- Limited budgets for training
- Learner readiness
- Inadequate technical infrastructure
- Lack of management support
- Learner resistance to change
- Instructor readiness
- Instructor or trainer resistance or buy-in

**Taiwan (44%), US (45%), and China (46%) governments were the least supportive. UK most supportive (62%), while Korea was 2nd (52%).**

15. Is the government of your country supportive of blended learning?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Support Level</th>
<th>Very Supportive</th>
<th>Somewhat Supportive</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Not Supportive</th>
<th>Not Supportive at All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Korea most likely to have a strategic plan at 85% and UK was 79%; China least likely at 71%; USA (72%) and Taiwan (71%) also less likely.**

16-a. Does your organization have a strategic plan for training and development?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choice</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Is the Plan Shared with Employees?**

16-b. If you have a plan, is it shared with employees on an internal company intranet web site?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choice</th>
<th>41%</th>
<th>16%</th>
<th>5%</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Is the Plan Publicly Available?**

16-c. If you have a plan, is it shared in a publically viewable Web site for anyone to download anytime?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choice</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Does Your Organization Need Any Other Blended Learning Advice?

Internationally, 47 percent need advice on BL design, development, implementation, or evaluation. This too would be lucrative area for consulting.

- 24% UK
- 21% USA
- 52% Korea
- 69% Taiwan
- 77% China
- 47% Overall

Is Yes, Who is the Primary Evaluator?

18. If you answered "YES" to the previous question who is the primary evaluator of the program?

If Yes, Evaluate BL at What Levels?

19. At what levels does your organization evaluate blended learning? (check all that apply)

- Level 1: learner satisfaction with the course
- Level 2: learning gains or skills and knowledge
- Level 3: change in behavior on the job
- Level 4: impact on the organization or results
- Level 5: return on investment

Percent Currently Blended?

20. What percentage of the training in your organization is currently devoted to blended learning?

Findings II:
The future State of Blended Learning
Knowledge management tools were ranked as the key technology among five countries for the next few years; highest in Korea (36%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KM</th>
<th>RLO</th>
<th>Phone/Mobile</th>
<th>Webcast/Streaming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How to Measure the Quality of Blended Courses?

Conclusions/Implications

- Increasing popularity & importance of BL
- Needs for training and HRD professionals on guidance on what BL means and how to implement BL in their organization
- Fast changing technology as one of the most significant issues in implementation of BL
- More collaborative, authentic and interactive instructional strategies and emerging technologies will impact the delivery of BL in coming years
- USA less likely to strategically plan for blended learning, share plans, or develop BL models.